## ADDRESSING CHARGES OF SOCIAL CLASS ELITISM IN FRENCH IMMERSION PROGRAMS SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

May 2015

| REFERENCE | CONTENT | URL |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Frenette, M., Chan, W (2015) Academic outcomes of public and private high school students: What lies behind the differences? Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series \#367, Statistics Canada, Ottawa <br> SOCIO-ECONOMIC STATUS IS POSITIVELY CORRELATED WITH GREATER ACHIEVEMENT IN ALL EDUCATION PROGRAMS, NOT ONLY FI. | Students at private high schools tend to outperform their public school counterparts, but this appears largely due to the more favourable socioeconomic backgrounds of private school students and their peers. <br> Students who attended private high schools were more likely to have socioeconomic characteristics positively associated with academic success. This includes having higher family incomes or university-educated parents <br> Two factors consistently accounted for a substantial portion of the differences in all academic outcomes examined-the socioeconomic characteristics of students and those of their peers. Combined, these factors accounted for about one-half of the difference in average standardized test scores and about two-thirds of the difference in university graduation rates. | http://www5.statcan.gc.ca/olc- <br>  <br> objType=46\&lang=en\&limit=0 |
| Council of Ministers of Education (2013) How Important Are Educational Expectations? Assessment Matters 4, Toronto: Author <br> NOT EXCLUSIVE TO FSL EDUCATION | Research has shown that there is a clear relationship between what parents expect and the achievement scores of students. Thus, parental expectations for educational attainment strongly predict students' scores across a variety of subjects (e.g., mathematics, language), and this relationship remains stable even after controlling for socioeconomic status (Fan, 2001; Neuenschwander et al., 2007). Moreover, the effects of early parental expectations (formed as early as Grade 1) tend to persist throughout the years of schooling, influencing children's performance and self-concept at later grades. <br> [S]tudent expectations are clearly reflected in their relative mathematics performance: those expecting to complete high school only have the lowest achievement scores, and those expecting to complete university have the highest. The performance gap between these two extremes is striking; it is more than 100 points (or almost two proficiency levels in mathematics). <br> Although we cannot expect Grade 8 students to decide on their professional career at this early stage, we may want them to think about the general level of education they wish to achieve, so that they can prepare for their future path in advance (e.g., choose the appropriate courses or seek early career information). Although some jurisdictions have already implemented mandatory career explorations as a requirement for high-school graduation, others may consider moving in this direction. | http://cmec.ca/Publications/Lists/Public ations/Attachments/316/AMatters_No4_ EN.pdf |

Sinay, E. (2010) Programs of Choice in the TDSB:
Characteristics of Students in French Immersion, Alternative Schools, and Other Specialized Schools and Programs, Toronto District School Board, Toronto

Dicks, J. (2008) The Case for Early French Immersion: A Response to J. Douglas Willms, University of New Brunswick, Fredericton

In 2009-10, a majority of the French Immersion students are from the highest family income decile ( $23 \%$ ). Only $4 \%$ of the French Immersion students are from the lowest family income decile (Figure 7).

A higher percentage of French Immersion students have a parent with university education than do students in the TDSB in general (76\% compared to $52 \%$ in Grades SK-6; 70\% compared to $42 \%$ Grades $7-8$; and $71 \%$ compared to $47 \%$ in Grades $9-12$ ) (Table 4). [O]verall about $4 \%$ of the French Immersion students are identified as having special education needs compared to $15 \%$ having special education needs in the TDSB in general

Special education students are found in larger numbers in non-immersion classes, and ... a higher percentage of students from upper socioeconomic groups enroll in EFI. However, this does not mean that there is something inherent in the EFI program that causes this to occur. Some vitally important questions to ask are:
Why do more parents of lower socioeconomic background not choose Early French Immersion for their children?
Why are $17 \%$ of students in NB schools on a modified instruction program? How are these students diagnosed? What are the root causes of these problems? What resources are available to address them?
How many students transfer out of EFI and why? What procedures and resources are there to assist these students so they can remain in EFI?

PISA results show that socioeconomic background was less of a factor in Canada than in most other countries with regard to test results (Bussière et al, 2000). Also, engagement has been found to be a more important variable than socioeconomic background with regard to student success on PISA. Kirsch et al (2002) define engagement in reading in terms student interest in reading, student attitudes toward reading, the time students spend on reading in their free time and the diversity of materials students read. These authors point out that students from the lowest socioeconomic backgrounds who are highly engaged in reading obtain higher average reading scores in PISA than students from high or medium socioeconomic backgrounds but who report to be poorly engaged in reading.

When gender, socio-economic background and parents' education are each taken into account (individually), French immersion students still outperform their counterparts in non-immersion programs. No one of these factors alone explains the high performance of these students."

This suggests that, rather than socioeconomic background, something specific to the experience of learning a second language may be contributing to EFI students' superior performance. One explanation can be found in research such as that of Bialystok (2001) who reports cognitive advantages for bilingual students compared to monolinguals.

Children from low socio-economic (SES) backgrounds struggle with school compared to children from higher SES backgrounds. However, students from low SES backgrounds in immersion

Genesee, F. (2008) The
Suitability of Immersion for All Learners: What Does the
Research Say? The State of French Second Language Education in Canada, Canadian Parents for French, Ottawa
perform just as well in English-language development and academic achievement as do students from the same SES backgrounds in English-language programs. At the same time, they function much more confidently in French than students in the English-language program.
http://www.tdsb.on.ca/Portals/O/comm unity/community\%20advisory\%20comm ittees/fslac/support\%2Ostaff/programso fchoicestudentcharacteristics.pdf

Statistics Canada (2008) French immersion 30 years later,

## Ottawa: Author

## Dicks, J. (2001) The French

Immersion and English Programs
in New Brunswick School
Districts 17 and 18: A
Comparison of Family
Background, Factors Influencing
Choice of Program, Attitudes
Choice of Program, Attitudes
toward French Immersion and
toward French Immersion and
Student Performance, University of New Brunswick

Overall, there is a strong relationship between reading achievement and family socio-economic (SES) background. While differences in family socio-economic background contribute to the high reading achievement of students in French immersion programs, the advantage held by French immersion students is not that straightforward.
In general, students in French immersion programs tend to come from better off families than nonimmersion students. However, in four provinces - Quebec, Manitoba, Saskatchewan and British Columbia - there were no real differences in the average family background of immersion and nonimmersion students.

Explores similarities and differences between various stakeholders in French Immersion and English programs in New Brunswick school districts 17 and 18. Although fewer students from lower socioeconomic (SES) backgrounds were enrolled in immersion, their performance matched that of those from higher SES backgrounds when IQ was held constant.

Immersion has been called elitist b/c children from middle- and high-SES are perceived to predominate in the program. However, in Ottawa \& Charlottown 50\% of students were enrolled in FI (therefore must have included some lower SES.)

Lower income families tend to move more often than those with higher incomes. Next school may not offer FI and when family moves again, the receiving school won't accept them into FI b/c they

Fl programs not always offered in low income areas and parents cannot afford to pay crossboundary transportation fees.

Screening tests to determine who would be best FI student should be viewed with skepticism because they are often a test of tractability rather than ability.
had missed a year.

Assumption that lower income students need all their time to master L1. Countered with knowledge of language transfer. had missed a year
http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/81-004-x/200406/6923-eng.htm
http://www.unb.ca/fredericton/secondlanguage/ resources/pdf/immersionrep ort.pdf

Halsall, N. (2001) Poverty and French Immersion Mix,
mmersion Journal 23(2),
Canadian Association of Immersion Teachers, Ottawa.

Hart, D., Lapkin, S. (1998) Issues Social-Class Bias in Access to French Immersion Education, In S. Lapin (ed)French Second language Education in Canada: Empirical Studies, University of Toronto Press, Ontario

This study reviewed the characterizations of immersion education as elitist in terms of the social class background of students, which have tended to be impressionistic and anecdotal. The author studied the body of quantitative data on education and occupations of parents of immersion students provided by research and evaluation studies by the Modern Language Centre, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. Findings suggest (a)that children from higher SES backgrounds are over-represented in Early Immersion enrollments; (b)that there is, however, social diversity in some student populations; (c) that attrition rates for lower SES immersion students provide no evidence for social-class bias at elementary levels, and only a slight bias at the secondary level; and (d)that there is little evidence that working class children are 'tracked out' by teachers since lower SES parents tend to give similar reasons for leaving immersion as higher SES parents, and since less than a quarter of all respondents cited teacher recommendation as the reason for leaving.

Holobow, N., Genesee, F., Lambert, W. (1991) The effectiveness of a foreign language immersion program for children from different ethnic and social class backgrounds:
and social class ba
Psycholinguistics 12(2),
Cambridge University Press

Collier, V. (1989) How Long? A
Synthesis of Research on
Academic Achievement in a
Second Language, TESOL
Quarterly 23(3),

Holobow, N., Genesee, F.
Lambert, W., Gastright, J., Met,
Lambert, W., Gastright, J., Met,
M. (1987) Effectiveness of partia
French immersion for children

French immersion for children
from different social class and from different social class and ethnic backgrounds, Applied Psycholinguistics 8(2), Cambridge University Press

This report presents the results of the second year of a 4-year longitudinal evaluation of a partia French immersion program in Cincinnati, Ohio. This program is of particular interest because it includes children from lower socioeconomic group and ethnic minority group (black) backgrounds in addition to majority group (white), middle-class students who have been the subject of virtually all evaluations of immersion to date. The native language development (English), academic achievement (math), and second language attainment (French) of pilot groups of middle- and working-class students and of black and white students who were in grade 1, as well as those of a follow-up cohort of kindergarten students, were assessed. The results showed that performance differences in English and mathematics between subgroups of students did not depend on the program of instruction they were receiving. Moreover, it was found that the working-class and black students scored as well as the middle-class and white students on the French language tests The results are discussed further in terms of the immersion students' level of proficiency in French.

Online PDF not available. Contact the national office

When students are schooled in two languages, with solid cognitive academic instruction provided in both the first and second languages, both language minority and language majority students generally take from 4 to 7 years to reach national norms on standardized tests in reading, social studies, and science (measures of thinking skills), whereas their performance may reach national norms in as little as 2 years in L1 and L2 tests in mathematics and language arts (the latter testing spelling, punctuation, and simple grammar points). Social class background does not appear to make a significant difference in academic achievement in a dual-language program,

A program of partial (half-day) French immersion in the Cincinnati Public Schools was evaluated in the kindergarten year. The English and French language development of participating native English-speaking children from both working and middle class backgrounds was assessed. The results indicated, firstly, that the pupils who spent half of their academic time in a foreign language (French) progressed just as well in English as carefully matched control pupils who followed a conventional all-English program. Secondly, it was found that socioeconomically underprivileged children (both black and white) benefited from an immersion-type introduction to a foreign language as much as pupils from middle class homes did. The degree of progress made in French was not linked with the social class background of the pupils even though this background factor clearly affected the students' performance on the English language tests. These results suggest

## http://journals.cambridge.org/action/dis

 6568\&fileld=S0142716400009139Holobow, N., Chartrand, L Lambert, W. (1985) A
Comparative Evaluation of
French Language Skills of Secondary Students in Various Programs of Study. Montréal, QC: Department of Psychology, McGill University, Quebec

This study demonstrated that children from low-income families do as well on tests as students from higher-income families. There were no significant differences in the results. Other factors, such as the distance, cost and information circulating about immersion, could have given access to immersion to one population rather than another. These challenges can be easily resolved by the school boards

